

EVALUATING THE CONTENT MARKETING STRATEGY OF 3 SUCCESSFUL BEAUTY VLOGGERS

Rr Rahmanissa Salsabila, Budi Permadi Iskandar, and Reza Ashari Nasution

¹*School of Business and Management ITB
rahmanissa@sbm-itb.ac.id*

²*School of Business and Management ITB
bpi@sbm-itb.ac.id*

³*School of Business and Management ITB
reza@sbm-itb.ac.id*

ABSTRACT

Social networking sites have turned into an avenue where marketers can augment their advertising campaigns to a more extensive scope of buyers. One of the most popular social media that helps marketers communicate their advertising campaigns is YouTube with *beauty vlogger* as the successful new phenomenon. *Beauty vloggers* – which are mostly done by young ladies – began composing and “*vlogging*” their beauty stuffs with professional attitude. Brands owners start promoting the *beauty vloggers* as their brand endorsers and asked them to paid-promote their products. They see *beauty vloggers* as another extraordinary marketing channel. *Beauty vloggers* have mesmerize the beauty lovers due to their effectiveness in utilizing their own particular content marketing strategy. Therefore, to be a famous *beauty vlogger*, they need content marketing strategy to attract as much as viewers to watch their videos. However, there is still lack of research related to the content marketing strategy. The content marketing strategy used by beauty vloggers as a new and effective marketing tool still questionable for some peoples. On the other hand, the success's of three *beauty vloggers* worldwide seen very clearly. So, the aim of the study – which uses qualitative content analysis – is to evaluate the content marketing strategy of three successful *beauty vloggers* worldwide. To obtain a comprehensive understanding to the theory and define the correct understanding, the analysis of the topic discussed using existed academic journals. The results of this study are the importance strategy of 'Expertise' and 'Trustworthy' in the content marketing of three *Beauty Vloggers*.

Keywords: *social media, YouTube, vloggers, beauty vloggers, content marketing strategy*

1. Introduction

Youtube, now became the 3rd most visited website in the world and more than half of YouTube views come from mobile devices (Press Room, 2017; Youtube Statistics, 2017). As of July 2015, more than 400 hours of video content were uploaded to YouTube every minute, it is one of social media that commonly use by people including artist to share their videos like beauty and fashion tips, vlogs, as well as instructional videos on everything from language learning to stain removal (Statista, 2017). Some of the most popular YouTube channels are not maintained by brands but by online personalities such as beauty vlog which made by beauty vlogger. Beauty vlogging is a phenomenon as a part of the ongoing evolution of beauty in media and review sharing technologies and it has risen to be one of marketing strategy (Bianchi, 2016). Successful beauty vloggers are subscribed and followed by many, at times even a huge number of fans and are basically a blend amongst business and celebrity. In any case, in opposition to many companies, they succeed, where many companie have tried and failed, in creating successful advertising video on Youtube (Rich, 2013). Behind the phenomenon, this research will evaluate how social media being a tool to the success of beauty vloggers and also its important for two things. First, the content marketing strategy used by beauty vloggers as a new and effective marketing tool in the best way still seems to be a question for some peoples. What

kind of content marketing strategies that make beauty vloggers success. Second, the findings of this research will therefore give new bits of knowledge to the phenomena of beauty vlogger and may stance to enthusiasm to successful video advertising in marketing.

Existing research has been basically focusing around the common youtuber (gamer, comedy, and daily vlog) for example 'How YouTube Developed Into a Successful Platform for User-generated Content' (Holland, 2016), 'Effects of Vlogger Race on Perceived Credibility, Self-efficacy, & Behavioral Intentions Toward Weight Loss' (Tang, 2016), Examining The Effect of Endorser Celebrity on The Consumers' Buying Intentions An Empirical Study in Turkey'. Those prior research mainly discusses about the viewers response to the video itself. However study about beauty vlogger is very rarely, some of them are 'Online Consumer Communities: A Study of The Beauty Gurus' (Holmquist, 2016), and 'Making Sense of Beauty Vlogging' (Sykes, 2014). Those research contributed toward the understanding of beauty vloggers' value proposition, the engagement between marketers and the beauty vloggers, why people watch their videos, and lastly about the viewers response to the beauty vlogs. Little is known about the beauty vlogger's content that attract the viewers to engage and give responses.

This research will fill this gap by conducting a study on select famous and successful beauty vloggers to identify part of their video content that become the source to their credibility. Rather than defining the factors of source credibility, it accepted the three factors as a framework in interpreting the messages in the videos as suggested by Ohanian (1990). In other words, this study is an endeavor to proof that the three factors are applied in the vlogging practices.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Social Media

Considering social media as a marketing tool a retailer must see each part of it. Social media cannot be comprehended without first defining Web 2.0: a term that describes another path in which end users use the World Wide Web, a place where content is continuously altered by all administrators in a sharing and community way (Kaplan & Haenlein 2010).

Social media helps companies to engage more with customes at a lower cost and a higher efficiency compared to traditional media. The features make social media an effective and powerful tool for large, medium and small-sized companies, and it also beneficial for multinational companies (Kaplan & Haenlein, 2010).

2.2 Social Media as New Promotion Channel

According to Debra Murphy (2010) these traditional media channels have included publications – newspapers, magazines, journals, radio, television, billboards, telephones, and face to face. However, as the needs and expectations of consumers evolve, marketing has no choice but to evolve as well (webpagefx.com, 2017). This is what has led to the rise of new media channel and the decrease in popularity of some of the traditional methods. According to Debra Murphy (2010) new media channels are Internet communication vehicles including websites/blogs, ocial media – Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, e-mail marketing, mobile, search engine, and videoconferencing.

Nowadays, more than 45,000 YouTube channels specializing in fashion and beauty videos, such as beauty talks, makeup tutorials and other suggestions (Beauty on YouTube, 2014). Each month, over 50 million people watch more than 1.6 billion minutes of consumer-created fashion and beauty videos on YouTube (StyleHaul, 2014). With social media, companies can talk to their customers and customers can talk to each other directly. That is why social media

becomes a hybrid element of the promotion mix.

2.3 Vlog

Vlog is a video blog or video log. It is a type of blog which the video is minimum, and is a type of web TV. Vlog passages frequently join implanted video (or a video interface) with supporting content, pictures, and other metadata (WhatIs.com, 2016). Passages can be recorded in one take or cut into different parts. The popularity of vlogs in the YouTube community has risen exponentially in the past few years (Hovden, 2013). Out of the top 100 most subscribed YouTube channels, 17 provide vlogs as their primary style of footage moreover builds exposure to different channels and also makes a sense of stability within the field.

2.4 Beauty Vloggers

Beauty vloggers is a person who make and post recordings on YouTube about their lives, their leisure activities and ranges in excellence circle ability (Fischer, 2014). Mark businesses made a consent to utilize the notoriety of beauty vlogger who exists in YouTube and paid them to advance their items verifiably in their excellence vlog utilizing their own substance promoting methodology (Bianchi, 2016). Some of excellence brands make beauty vlogger as brand endorser and was welcome to a few occasion promoting to take after the discussion. They see beauty vlogger as another extraordinary methodology for advertising their beauty item. Top beauty vloggers are welcome to see the beauty item propelling, for example, another establishment or lipstick propelling by some famous beauty item brand and they have a front column seat on that occasion. Indeed, even some fortunate beauty vlogger been a judges in make up rivalry which is made by famous beauty item brand mark as well. Beauty vlogger turn into the new ruler for beauty lovers on account of their effective effect in utilizing their own particular content marketing strategy.

2.5 Track Record

Track record is the best recorded performance in a particular track-and-field event that someone or something has had in the past (dictionary.cambridge.org, 2017). This study talk about the track record of a beauty vlogger so it is referring to their past performance and achievements of each beauty vlogger. This study needs beauty vlogger with a good track record in investment such as have a 'howto' channel YouTube from around 2007, the beauty vlogger's job, reached on million subscribers, get an award from a well-known organization in beauty industry, have a project related beauty and fashion things, an author of a book, have their own brand.

2.6 Content Marketing Strategy

Content marketing is substantially more than making, dispersing and sharing content keeping in mind the end goal to connect with audiences, generate leads, improve branding, and other advertising objectives from the marketing manager. It needs a key approach and that is the thing that a content marketing strategy is all about (De Clerck, 2014). A content marketing strategy worry to the limited train of marketing content (Halvorson & Rach White, 2016).

In order to drive gainful customer action, beauty vlogger ought to making and appropriating important, relevant, and consistent content to draw in group of onlookers or audience. Rather than pitching an items or administrations, beauty vloggers giving really relevant and valuable content. It needs a key approach and that is what a content marketing strategy is all

about. Content marketing fits in a more extensive integrated marketing strategy and it requires its very own strategy. In any case, similarly as all different respect to particular showcasing systems (for example, email advertising or online networking promoting) such a strategy should be incorporated in a more extensive strategy (contentmarketinginstitute.com, 2016).

2.7 Source Credibility Model

Credibility refers to a person's perception of the truth of a piece of information. It is a multi-dimensional concept that serves as a means for the receiver of the information to rate the source or transmitter of the communication in relation to the information. This rating correlates with the willingness of the receiver to attribute truth and substance to the information (Hovland et al. 1953, p.21). To understand credibility further there are some routes of research. The first is in defining the factors of credibility. The second is to discuss it as a communication. The third as a persuasion. There are other lines of research, among others comparing the influences of different type of sources (Waldt, Loggerenberg and Wehmeyer, 2009; Jonas, 2010), the effect of QPVR (quantity of posts, views and reviews) to perceived credibility and perceived usefulness (Mir & Rehman, 2013), the effect of source credibility to purchase intention (O'connor, 2015, Ananda & Harimurti, 2016; Martawilaga & Puspanegara, 2016).

Since Aristotle era source credibility or ethos is believed as the most potent means of persuasion or generating of understanding. As Aristotle suggested source credibility is multidimensional: intelligence, character and good will. Hovland et al (1953) recommended Expertness, Trustworthiness, Intention toward receiver. Berlo, Lemert, Mertz (1969) put Safety, Qualification, Dynamism forward. Ohanian (1990) proposed attractiveness, expertise and trustworthiness. Hu (2015) came with competence, trustworthiness and attractiveness. Other dimensions were added and changed by various researcher. However, the main factors are still attractiveness, expertise and trustworthiness.

Beside expertise and trustworthiness the subsequent factor - attractiveness - was debated as physical attractiveness (Ohanian) and non-physical attractiveness (McGuire, 1985). McGuire definition is likability, familiarity and similarity (Ohanian, 1990). However Berlo, Lemert and Mertz (1969) suggested dynamism as aggressive, emphatic, bold, active and energetic; which partly resembles McGuire's non-physical attractiveness. In this study attractiveness is seen more as the McGuire definition, because the message mostly didn't discuss the physical attractiveness.

Besides defining the factors of credibility some studies applied the factors to information accuracy, adding knowledge, information relevance and purchase intention. One of the problem around this category is in separating the receiver attitude from the transmitter (McCroskey & Young, 1981) or a study of perception of receiver about the source credibility. However, we can also apply it in a communication process. As a communication or a transmission of believable information we have to consider the three part of communication, i.e. the source characteristics (expertise, trustworthiness, attractiveness and others), message characteristics (content, plausibility, internal consistency) and the receiver characteristics (background, beliefs) (Wathen & Kurbell, 2002). Most studies discussed assumed a fairly constant message quality and discussed the relations between receivers and transmitters.

One could choose two different avenues to persuade, i.e. by content quality (message) or peripheral cues (credibility of the transmitter). The receiver, then, process the first systematically. While the receiver faces difficulties in processing the message, the receiver resorts to a heuristic process to handle both the message cues and the peripheral cues (Petty & Cacioppo, 1986). While dealing with a credibility problem, one will deal with the problem at

several levels: interactive level, heuristics and construct level. At the construct level receiver examining truthfulness, believability, trustworthiness, objectivity and reliability of the message (Hilligos & Rieh, 2008) or expertise and trustworthiness.

This study processed the messages transmitted by three Beauty Vloggers through 63 videos and developed a thematic concept code. Rather than defining the factors of source credibility, it accepted the three factors as a framework in interpreting the messages in the videos. In other words, this study is an endeavor to prove that the three factors are applied in the vlogging practices. Although it discussed the Hilligos & Rieh Construct Level, the messages interpretation went further from expertise and trustworthiness to attractiveness. This study, then, fill the gap of understanding verbal messages as part of credibility building.

2.8 Thematic Content Analysis

This study used thematic analysis as the chosen one from many qualitative content analysis tools. It can be describe as “a research method for the subjective interpretation of the content of text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes and patterns” (Hsieh & Shannon, 2005, p. 1278). After that the researcher used kind of open coding to identify of themes and patterns through “segmenting the data information and reassembling them” (Boeije, 2010, p. 94). Since the purpose of this study is evaluating content marketing strategies by beauty vloggers by analysing their videos themes and patterns, this is the ideal method for answering the research question. In order to see the key success factor of beauty vloggers, themes and pattern of the videos content which has three factors of source credibility model will be analyzed for giving conclusion or result.

3. Methodology

This research used a qualitative content analysis as a method. This analysis will focus on three successful beauty vloggers, with a follower count of over one million, and 21 videos of them will analyzed, which consist of ten videos before they reach one million subscribers, one video when they reach, and ten videos after it in order to find out more about their content marketing strategies employed in their YouTube channel as one of their social media. This study used thematic analysis as the chosen one from many qualitative content analysis tools.

Just like the case inthematic analysis, this study adopted an inductive approach to qualitative content analysis, implying that the data information will be analyzed through open coding (Elo & Kyngäs, 2007). In this stage, the information will be assembled together in particular classes, coding the information as indicated by themes or topics. The inductive approach "moves from the particular to the general, specific cases are watched and afterward joined into a bigger entire or general articulation" (Elo & Kyngäs, 2007, p. 109). Along these lines, classifications will later be gathered together under "higher order headings" (Elo & Kyngäs, 2007, p. 111) and data found will be utilized to understand the content marketing strategies used by beauty vloggers.

3.1 Data Collection

This research is classified as applied research since it is aimed to evaluate the content marketing strategy of three successful beauty vloggers worldwide in their YouTube channels when they promote many brand cosmetics with their own content. The researcher chose international and not domestic beauty vlogger because based on find out more about beauty vlogger in domestic, they are not having much and fit knowledge in terms of beauty and fashion product, not really details treatment information, benefit, and value of a product, and not very

sensitive in make the content about the latest beauty things trend compare to international. This study used qualitative method by having the data through thematic analysis. Based on their track record, the three successful beauty vloggers that chosen having more than one million subscribers, and this is three beauty vloggers have been chosen:

1. Zoella Sugg | zoella280390 youtube username
2. Fleur de Force | fleurdeforce youtube username
3. Tanya Burr | tanyaburr youtube username

Why the chosen beauty vloggers should have reached one million subscriber milestone, because it is related with the fact it shows their communication strategies are in the third stage of personal branding on YouTube (Chen, 2013). Youtubers who are in the third stage as of now have radiated their personal branding and their identity well clearly, and now they are no longer build their brand, they are in the period of keeping up their branding strategy. Accordingly, the data collected was divided from three parts. First from Zoella's YouTube account, second from Fleur De Force's YouTube account, and the last from Tanya Burr's YouTube account.

3.2 Operationalization of Variables

Attractiveness will be evaluated from three aspects: posting schedule, friendliness, fan engagement, and backdrop video. Posting schedule is important because it shows the beauty vlogger as the professional influencer. It is also important to build the likeability of the vloggers from the viewpoint of the viewers (Sashi, 2012). Friendliness delivered in the way beauty vlogger tried to be friendly as best friend to the viewers, build their channel become two-way communication including says greetings dan farewell statement. The two are seen as an important communication strategy to create intimacy needed for relationship building and to ultimately increase engagement, as it connects the viewer to the beauty vlogger (Sashi, 2012). Engagement is key to relationship building and maintenance. This variable measured through total subscribers, likes, and comments in their YouTube's channels (Sashi, 2012). Futhermore, engagement build by beauty vloggers with the way they asked their viewers to subscribe, like, give a comment or suggestion as well. This is known as interactivity which is the most essential tool to organisation-public relationship building, and is thus of importance to customer engagement (Sashi, 2012). Baird & Parasnis (2011) add the other indicator from engagement. According to them, one of engagement indicator is when beauty vlogger asked what kind of video theme their vieweres want. This gives the viewers a chance to share their own input with the vlogger, and, on top of that, gives them the chance of being noticed, showing the beauty vlogger understands the importance of finding out what their customer community values. Element terakhir dari attractiveness adalah backdrop video. Attractiveness is really important in advertising of product that requires appearance of the source itself (Ohanian, 1990). Therefore, Ohanian (1990) conclude that bahwa backdrop video could be one of beauty vlogger's attractiveness that could attract viewers response to the beauty vlogs.

Meanwhile expertise, will be evaluated from three aspects: the beauty vlogger's expertise and the latest make up and beauty trend of them. Finding beauty vlogger's expertise through evaluate their statement about the fit of use of product in certain circumstance, and product and treatment information is important because it is several strategies that have been employed by the beauty vloggers to increase credibility towards their audience. Through having the specific expertise they can be categorized as a credible communicator (Perloff, 2010). For the second aspect, the researcher thought the way beauty vlogger's shows her knowledge can be seen by the way they know the latest make up and beauty trend because it stated they are pay attention to the beauty industry and aware of the importance having that knowledge for their credibility.

The last part is trustworthy. Trustworthy will be evaluated from three aspects: appreciating other expertise, mentioning the brand, and impartiality. When referring to another Youtuber in terms of a beauty product purchase, this same effect takes place. First of all, this strategy is linked to the previously mentioned downplaying of authority and claiming of a social status within the Youtube community, as mentioning another successful Youtuber as a friend puts the beauty vlogger in the same category. By doing this, authority within the Youtube community is achieved (Perloff, 2010). By claiming this social status as well, they do confirm that within the Youtube community they are top of the league and in fact do exude authority. The way in which this is done, through downplaying authority, definitely plays into their brand image of the ordinary celebrity (Burgess & Green, 2013), that is crucial to their trustworthiness and thus credibility. Then mentioning the brand measured through the beauty products and fashion items which in a part of a beauty vlog. It is because when they are already ‘part of the message’, it turn to be something that is important in persuading audiences in terms of product placement (Williams, et al., 2011, Kretchmer, 2004). The beauty products should explicitly mentioned and shown in the vlogs. The last is impartiality and it can be measured by beauty vlogger’s statement about the first time they used the product and their honest feelings about product. First of all, within the data, the vloggers mention several times that they have been scared to try a new beauty product or a new fashion trend because of the fact that they ‘could not pull it off’. By statements like these, they reaffirm their normal, everyday status, by saying they are just like everyone else, playing into the ordinary celebrity status (Burgess & Green, 2013).

3.3 Data Analysis

The purpose of content analysis is “to provide knowledge and understanding phenomenon under study” (Downe-Wamboldt, 1992, p. 314). In this study, qualitative content analysis is characterized as a research method for the subjective interpretation of the content of text data information through the efficient classification procedure of coding and recognizing themes or patterns, and thematic analysis can helps analyze large textual data information.

1. Determination of Level Analysis

The level analysis will based on words, phrases, clauses, sentences, and paragraphs. Each sentences from transcribed video was given a contextual related keyword to represent the latent meaning in the video.

2. Determination of Concepts to Code

The determination of concepts will categorized the large data to several categories relate to element and source credibility model concept.

3. The data will be recorded based on frequency of keywords appeared.

4. Concepts Differentiation

In analysing, there are possibilities of some words or phrases appear with same meaning. Therefore, there must be clear limitation to distinguish among concept and each concept developed above has different meanings and context. Below is the coding code and its example in order to create a better understanding towards the concepts differentiation above:

Table 3. 1 Concepts Differentiation to Code

Source Credibility Model	Thematic Content	Description	Examples in Transcribed Videos
--------------------------	------------------	-------------	--------------------------------

Attractiveness	Posting Schedule	When the beauty vlogger said statement about her video uploaded schedules	“Hey guys and welcome back! I have been absent from YouTube for actually not that long just a little over a week. But I missed two of my usual upload dates and it feels rubbish I've missed you guys.” – <i>Fleur De Force in Beauty & Fashion Haul: Boots, Zara & Primark!</i>
	Friendly	The consistency of beauty vlogger greets and says goodbye to the viewers, says something about their personal, and build two way communication.	“I tweet about it and those of you just tweet the lyrics back to me and they like “oh my God thanks for telling me about this song”. “I'll see you in my next video, love you guys, bye!” – <i>Tanya Burr in My Birthday Makeup Tutorial 2013!</i>
	Fan Engagement	Total subscribers, likes, and comments in their YouTube's channels.	Appendix C: Fan Engagement
		When beauty vlogger asked their viewers to subscribe, like, give a comment or suggestion and asked to the viewers what kind of video theme they want.	“if there's anything else that you want me to try and replicate for you then do let me know in the comments. If you like this style of video you want me to do more things like this then give it thumbs up.” – <i>Zoella in How to: My Quick and Easy Hairstyles</i>
Backdrop Videos	Analyzing the backdrop from 21 videos used by each beauty vloggers.	Appendix D: Beauty Vlogger's Backdrop Videos	
Expertise	Beauty Vlogger's Expertise	Beauty vlogger's statement about the fit of use of product in certain circumstance, and about product and treatment information.	“it's basically two concealers in the bottom and then you get a setting powder and little puff in the top and the concealers are actually different color. So one of the more yellow tone to cover redness and the other one is more pink tone to cover dark circles under your eyes. These are super creamy is the first thing I want to say.” – <i>Fleur De Force in Beauty, Fashion, Jewelry Haul!</i>
		Beauty vlogger's statement about the latest make up and beauty trend.	“This next product is also something that is quite “cold” beauty product a lot of people have spoken about it a lot of people have raved about it.” – <i>Zoella in February Favourites</i>
Trustworthy	Appreciating Other Expertise	When beauty vloggers referencing of others people.	“There are some of my favorite videos to watch on YouTube last night was watching some of <i>Vivianna Does Makeup</i> I don't know if you know her. If you don't, um check her out, I'll link it down below. I've just really kind of got into her videos and I find her voice really calming and she has really good

			skin care tips.” – Tanya in My April 2013 Beauty Random Favourites
		When beauty vloggers referencing and/or promote others beauty vloggers YouTube channel.	“We filmed a video for Joe’s channel because Joe has a channel this time. Did you? Joe: the first ever code is we are brother and sister Zoe: make sure to click his face now and it will take you to the video or you can wait to the end where they’ll be a big link and make sure you subscribe to him once do that.” – Zoella in My Brother Does My Makeup
	Criticizing Brand	When beauty vloggers mentioning the brand.	“Anyway long haul video the first place I order things from was Feelunique.com.” – Fleur De Force in Beauty Haul! NYX, Feelunique, SpaceNK
	Impartiality	Beauty vlogger’s statement about the first time they used the product.	“And then the last thing is this Bourjois Queen Attitude Khol Kajal because look up the scary they look I’ve never used one of these.” – Zoella in Huge Collective Haul & Giveaway
		Beauty vlogger’s statement of their honest feelings about beauty and fashion things.	“it says 10 hour wear on it. I don’t agree with that bit, sorry Bourjois I just agree with the fact that it very nice.” – Tanya Burr in August Beauty, Food & Music Favourites!
		When beauty vlogger said the truth about theirself, what they can and can not do.	“I am rubbish at applying false eyelashes just rubbish.” – Zoella in 50 Facts About Me

Notes:

- = Highlight color for ‘Attractiveness’
- = Highlight color for ‘Expertise’
- = Highlight color for ‘Expertise’

5. Code the texts

The coding process will be done through conventional process or manually through Excel Software with filter tools and function systems. The researcher decide appropriate keywords to represent the context in each transcript. This conventional process will ease the researchers to recognize errors rather than use content analysis software.

6. Quantitative Analysis

Each keywords frequency will be quantified then categorized to three concepts or categories stated above related to elements and contents of video. This frequency formed in score to see the likeliness of this categories emerged and for this study, the standard for the categories are:

- If the frequency of one category repeated more than 60% from total frequency then it called as ‘has a lot of repetition’.

- The repetitive words which reach 60% dominant than the others from total frequency then it called as ‘dominant’.
 - The ‘dominant’ which have a specific findings called ‘extreme’.
7. Lastly, this research will provide conclusion and recommendation according to the findings and analysis of the data. The result of content analysis summarized according to the theories and the findings seen from extreme, dominant, and has a lot of repetition. However it used in order to answer the aforementioned research question. Other than that, recommendation also be constructed according to the results and conclusion of this study.

1. Result and Analysis

1.1 Analyzing Content

The content analysis had been conducted to answer three research question related to source credibility model that should be constructed by the beauty vloggers to persuade their viewers. Seen from the findings that has a lot of repetition, dominant, and extreme, the result shows that three beauty vlogger has the same strong components which belong to two concept of source credibility model, that is ‘Expertise’ and ‘Trustworthy’. Through ‘Expertise’ concept, the findings of repetitive, dominant, and extreme can be seen from the way beauty vloggers always repeat statement the usage, benefit, and value of products. It is happened because viewers should gain knowledge and the benefit from watching the video, so viewers feels they need it. Meanwhile the finding of ‘Trustworthy’ concept which is basically the impartiality of a beauty vlogger can be seen from four things being repetitive, dominant, and extreme by beauty vlogger, that is downplaying which is divided into two, downplaying in terms of beauty and fashion industry, and downplaying in terms of young woman life, also when a beauty vloggers repeats the first time in buying a product, telling a disappointing product, and when mention the brand.

1.2 Attractiveness

Attractiveness is really important in advertising of product that requires appearance, such as fashion and cosmetics. Attractiveness has to do with social values and its overall perception, including how influencers attract their viewers through similarity, familiarity, and likability. Given the nature of the cosmetics industry, beauty and attractiveness has become one of the most significant factors in choosing influencers and spokespeople. Therefore, in here will be discussed three beauty vloggers strategy in attract viewers to perceived similarity, familiarity, and likability of the beauty vlogger.

1.2.1 Posting Schedule

There are two types of videos, first is regular videos, Zoella post every Sunday and Tanya on Friday because they tend to suit their viewers day off in weekend from school or work. Meanwhile, Fleur on Monday and around Saturday or Friday because she is a housewife and want to be an inspiration for any people in her age. For their monthly favourite videos, Zoella and Tanya upload at the beginning of the month while Fleur at the end of the month.

1.2.2 *Friendliness*

In general, the three beauty vloggers did the same thing when greetings their viewers at the beginning of video and saying goodbye at the end of video. Throughout that, the viewer is addressed in a manner that is best described as personal and friendly. They tried to be as friendly as best friend to their viewers. The three beauty vloggers have in common to build their channel become two-way communication. Within this friendly strategy, they speaks directly into the camera as if talking to a friend, they use the same informal personal style when communicate with their viewers. This results happened because in terms of customer engagement strategies of the beauty vloggers, this strategy seems to be one of important strategy to built a fan engagement. All three beauty vloggers make use of fan engagement strategies highly, because this is the way to keep personal dialogue between vlogger and viewer going. In fact, this two-way interactive communication between vlogger and viewer can be found in some way in every single video, alluding to this being a big success factor in the relationship building practices employed by the beauty vloggers since fan engagement is key to relationship building and maintenance (Sashi, 2012).

1.2.3 *Fan Engagement*

The best engagement from shared video come from 'Story Videos' especially personal life, this happened because many people said in the comment sections they happy to know more about beauty vloggers personality, as if Zoella as a teenager, Fleur as a housewife, and Tanya as *a professional makeup artist*. The second is collaboration videos because those who watch this video is not only from beauty vlogger's viewers or subscribers but also people who used to watch their partner as another youtuber.

1.2.4 *Backdrop Videos*

In general, the three beauty vloggers seems not considered their backdrop as something can attracts their viewers. Mostly they did the video on their bedroom because they tried to position their viewers again, as a friend who is allowed to see their private thing which is bedroom. They are aware the importance of eliminating the gap between them as an influencer person with common people who watch, to feel comfortable and feel the openness of them.

1.3 Expertise

In general, the three beauty vloggers seems not considered their background as something can attracts their viewers. Mostly they did the video on their bedroom because they tried to position their viewers again, as a friend who is allowed to see their private thing which is bedroom. They are aware the importance of eliminating the gap between them as an influencer person with common people who watch, to feel comfortable and feel the openness of them. The three beauty vloggers have more than one different expertise in beauty industry, based on data analysis, the results are:

1. Zoella has a repetitive in fashion clothing and personal life, dominant in personal life, and extreme in teenage needs.
2. Fleur has a repetitive in skincare, handbags, and jewelry, dominant in skincare and popular handbags, and extreme in detailed skincare informations and detailed descriptions of handbags.
3. Tanya has a repetitive in cosmetics and makeup techniques, dominant in cosmetics and smokey eye look, and extreme in step by step tutorial.

Based on 21 videos that have been analysed, the three beauty vloggers have more than one different expertise in beauty industry. Specifically in terms of usage, benefit, and value.

4.3.1 Latest Make up and Beauty Trend

The three beauty vloggers have their own trends on beauty things like for Zoella with her 'My Pamper Evening Essentials', Fleur with her 'Creative Bag Wardrobe', and Tanya with her 'Mix n Match Cosmetics'.

4.4 Trustworthy

Trustworthy is able to be relied on as honest or truthful. These are the core characteristics of a good influencer. Trustworthiness refers to the degree of viewers belief that a beauty vlogger provides information in a sincere, fair, honest, and honorable manner. Within a more transparent content of video, viewers will more attracted to follow a beauty vlogger. Therefore, a trustworthy beauty vlogger is expected to have all the core values of trustworthiness.

4.4.1 Appreciating Other Expertise

This kind of strategy found in the cross-promotion, the way a beauty vlogger makes a collaboration video and referencing of others. Moreover, they draw upon the expertise of others. This strategy thus on the one hand increases trustworthy when they persuade the viewers but on the other hand reaffirms the social status of the beauty vlogger as the ordinary people.

4.4.2 Critisizing Brand

The negative brand information given by beauty vlogger is important because once beauty vlogger said the real truth about the lack of product it can persuade viewers in terms to not buying again the product or even trying it. However the positive brand information which is explicitly mentioned in the vlogs repeatedly, does not feel like promotion is taking place, as nothing differs from the usual dialogue of the vlogger. It shows that a positive brand names placement in beauty video is thus often very subliminal and it is the strength of this strategy.

4.4.3 Impartiality

All three beauty vloggers downplaying of themselves in terms of beauty and fashion trends even in terms of young woman life. They persuade their viewers to think they are like everybody else nowadays who just had an opportunity to make something through their creativity so viewers could think it seems like not a big deal to trust them. Then it will be easier for the beauty vloggers to deliver the purpose of their video content as well.

2. Conclusion

This study has reviewed 'Attractiveness' by analyzing how beauty vloggers built similarity, familiarity and likability by showing their casual life and analyze the responses of their subscribers. The responses of the subscribers are measured by calculating the related likes and net positive comments. Against the hesitations of other researchers (Waldt, et al., 2009) the results suggests that Attractiveness is an important part of Credibility. However, the main role of attractiveness is to attract viewers to visit the video blog. The elements that build credibility are expertise and trustworthiness.

On expertise, the content is the way beauty vloggers shows her knowledge about the fit of use of product in certain circumstance, and product and treatment information, more specifically

dominant in usage, benefit, and value of products. The customer get education from the celebrity endorsement is an important feature to the engagement as explained by Sashi (2012). When a beauty vlogger is able to give education in their video it means they are meet the word expertise and viewers will love the video. However because no human is perfect, when beauty vloggers make mistakes or lack of knowledge in showing their expertise as it does not fully provide good education and viewers feel they did not get the benefit, they will at least only dislike the video, but will still subscribe the beauty vloggers.

Meanwhile for trustworthy, basically it is a beauty vlogger's impartiality comes from downplaying, first time in buying products, telling disappointing product, and mention the brand. The trustworthiness is one of influencer person as a communicator characteristics which is persuasive and is the key factors to a successful celebrity endorser (McPherson & Li, 2012; Hung, 2014). Based on video analysis, none of the beauty vloggers do not build and keep these trustworthy points very well. All trying to maintain trustworthy as much as possible. Because different from expertise, trustworthy deals with the impartiality of a beauty vloggers, this is very important to be maintained because once beauty vloggers make mistakes or lies, viewers will not only dislike the video but will tend to unsubscribes beauty vloggers.

3. Recommendation

Based on the conclusion of this paper, there are two recommendations as the results of this paper. First for a practition, regarding 'friendly' terms to be one of beauty vloggers content marketing strategy, it will better if a beauty vloggers doing a direct personal approach. Then, collaboration videos also a great way. Makes more collaboration videos especially with another youtuber in different interest categories who have no related or experts in beauty and fashion area. This can expand beauty vlogger's viewers. Makes more challenge video also can easily help spread the beauty vlogger's channel because it will spread like positive words of mouth and ended up increase the views and subscribers. As supporting the conclusion that attractiveness is an important part of credibility, it is important for a beauty vlogger to reveal more about their personal life that is useful for others.

Second, the recommendations for further research, a beauty vlogger must have a point of difference. From the findings of this study, each beauty vlogger has more than one point of differences. So it can be applied to wider market. Since there are still many area in beauty sphere which can be a beauty vlogger's point of difference, it means there are big opportunities for new beauty vlogger to come up. Paying attention to the backdrop of video also can be one consideration for a beauty vlogger to attract viewers.

References

- Applbaum, R., Anatol, K. (1972), *The Factor Structure of Source Credibility as a Function of the Speaking Situation*. Speech Monographs, 39, 216-222.
- Atkin, C., Block, M. (1983), 'Effectiveness of Celebrity Endorsers', *Journal of Advertising Research*, 23(1), 57-61.
- Beauty on Youtube. (2014). Retrieved from <http://www.pixability.com/industry-studies/beautystudy/>
- Berlo, D. K., Lemert, J. B., Mertz, R. J. (1969), *Dimensions for Evaluating the Acceptability of Message Sources*. Public Opinion Quarterly, 33, 563-576.
- Bianchi, S. *The Huffington Post*, 2016, Why Beauty Bloggers Are More Powerful Than Celebrities, retrieved on 17 Apr. 2017 from: http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/sophie-bianchi/beauty-bloggers-zoella_b_11566248.html
- Boeije, H. (2010). *Analysis in qualitative research*. London: Sage publications.

- Bowers, J., Phillips, W. (1967), *A Note on the Generality of Source Credibility Scales*. Speech Monographs, 34, 185-186.
- Cha, M., Kwak, H., Rodriguez, P., Ahn, Y. Y., & Moon, S. (2007). I tube, you tube, everybody tubes: analyzing the world's largest user generated content video system. *IMC'07*, 1-14.
- Chen, C. P. (2013). Exploring personal branding on YouTube. *Journal of Internet Commerce*, 12(4), 332-347.
- David, S. H., & Austad, B. (2004). Factors Predicting the Effectiveness of Celebrity Endorsement Advertisements. *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol 38 Iss: 11/12, 1509-1526.
- Debevec, K., Kernan, J.B. (1984), *More Evidence on the Effects of a Presenter's Physical Attractiveness: Some Cognitive, Affective and Behavioral Consequences*, In: *Advances in Consumer Research*, (Ed.) Thomas C. Kinnear, Vol. 11, Provo, Utah: Association for Consumer Research, 127 -132.
- Downe-Wamboldt B. (1992) Content analysis: method, applications and issues. *Health Care for Women International* 13, 313–321.
- Duriau, Reger, & Pfarrer. (2007). *A Content Analysis of the Content Analysis Literature in Organization Studies: Research Themes, Data Sources, and Methodological Refinements*. *Organization Research Methods*, 10: 5–34.
- Elo, S., & Kyngäs, H. (2008). The qualitative content analysis process. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 62(1), 107-115.
- Erdogan, B.Z. (1999), *Celebrity Endorsement: A Literature Review*. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 41(3), 291-314.
- Fischer, T. (2014). Makeup, YouTube, and Amateur Media in the Twenty-First Century.
- Foux, G. (2006, May 8). Consumer-generated media: Get your customers involved. *Brand Strategy*, 38—39.
- Goldsmith, R., Lafferty, B., Newell, S. (2000), The Impact of Corporate Credibility and Celebrity Credibility on Consumer Reaction to Advertisement and Brands. *Journal of Advertising*, 6 (2): 1-16.
- Halvorson K., Rach M., *Content Strategy For the Web*, Second Edition, New Riders, U.S.A. 2012.
- Hautz, J., Füller, J., Hutter, K & Thürndl, C (2014). Let Users Generate Your Video Ads? The Impact of Video Source and Quality on Consumers' Perceptions and Intended Behaviors *Journal of Interactive Marketing Vol 28* 1-15.
- Henderson, A., & Bowley, R. (2010). Authentic dialogue? The role of “friendship” in a social media recruitment campaign. *Journal of Communication Management*, 14(3), 237-257.
- Hodder, I. (1994). *The interpretation of documents and material culture*. Thousand Oaks etc.: Sage. p. 155. [ISBN 0761926879](https://doi.org/10.1017/9780520268799).
- Hovland, C. I., L. Janis, and H. H. Kelley, *Communications and Persuasion: Psychological Studies in Opinion Change*, CT, New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953.
- Hovland, I., & Weiss, W. (1951). *The Influence of Source Credibility on Communication Effectiveness*. *Public Opinion Quarterly* 15(4), 635-650.
- "How Much Do YouTubers Make? The Top 25 Earning Creators' AdSense Salaries Revealed [Infographic]". New Media Rockstars. Retrieved September 26, 2014.
- Hsieh, H. F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative health research*, 15(9), 1277-1288.
- Hsiu-Fang Hsieh Sarah E. Shannon, 2005. *Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis*.
- Hussain, S., Ahmed, W., Jafar, R.M.S., Rabnawaz, A & Jianzhou, Y., (2016). “eWOM Source Credibility, Perceived Risk and For Product Consumer's Information Adoption”. *Computers in Human Behavior*. 66: 96-102. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.09.034>
- Internet World Stats*. (2017). Retrieved March 30, 2017, from <http://www.internetworldstats.com/>
- Kaplan, A.M., & Haenlein, M. (2010). Users of the world, unite! The challenges and opportunities of social media. *Business Horizons*, 59-68.
- Katz, D. & Kahn, R.L., 1975, *The Social Psychology of Organizations* (2nd ed.), New York: Wiley. Wibisono, D., 2003, *Riset Bisnis: Panduan bagi Praktisi dan Akademisi*, Jakarta, INA: Gramedia Pustaka
- Lempert, P. (2006). Caught in the Web. *Progressive Grocer*, 85 (12), 18.
- "Lights camera Lipstick". Eva Wiseman meets the vloggers. *The Observer*, 12.
- Mangold, W. G., & Faulds, D. J. (2009). Social media: the new hybrid element of the promotion mix. *Business Horizons*, Vol.52 No.4, pp. 357-365.

- McCarthy, Jerome E. (1964). *Basic Marketing. A Managerial Approach*. Homewood, IL: Irwin. p. 769. [ISBN 0256025339](#).
- McCombs, M., & Reynolds, A. (2002). News influence on our picture of the world. *Media Effects: Advances in theory and research*.
- Murphy, D. (2010). What is Content Marketing?. Retrieved September 19 from <https://www.forbes.com/sites/joshsteimle/2014/09/19/what-is-content-marketing/#2288443310b9>
- Neuendorf, K. (2002). *The Content Analysis Guidebook*. Sage Publications.
- Pornpitakpan, C. (2003). Validation of the celebrity endorsers credibility scale: Evidence from Asians. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 19, 1(2), 179-195.
- Ohanian, R. (1990) 'Construction and validation of a scale to measure celebrity endorsers' perceived expertise, trustworthiness, and attractiveness', *Journal of Advertising*, 19(3), pp. 39-52
- Ohanian, R. (1991). The Impact of Celebrity Spokesperson's Perceived Image on Consumer *Journal Advertising Research Vol 31 No 1*.
- Perloff, R. M. (2010). *The dynamics of persuasion: Communication and attitudes in the twenty-first century* (4th ed.). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Press Room. (2017). Retrieved March 30, 2017, from <https://www.youtube.com/yt/press/statistics.html>
- Rajagopal (2007). *Marketing dynamics theory and practice*. New Delhi: New Age International. [ISBN 978-81-224-2712-7](#).
- Rashtchy, F., Kessler, A. M., Bieber, P. J., Shindler, N. H., & Tzeng, J. C. (2007, February). *The user revolution: The new advertising ecosystem and the rise of the Internet as a mass medium*. Minneapolis, MN: Piper Jaffray Investment Research
- Rich, J. R. (2013). *Ultimate Guide to YouTube for Business*. Irvine, CA: Entrepreneur
- Rosengren, K. E. (1981). *Advances in Scandinavia content analysis: An introduction*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- R. Hovden (2013). "Bibliometrics for Internet media: Applying the h-index to YouTube". 64 (11): 2326–2331. doi:10.1002/asi.22936.
- Sashi, C. M. (2012). Customer engagement, buyer-seller relationships, and social media. *Management Decision*, 50(2), 253-272.
- Sertoglu, A.E., Catli, O. & Korkmaz, S., 2014, Examining the Effect of Endorser Credibility on the Consumers' Buying Intentions: An Empirical Study in Turkey. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 4 (1): 66-77.
- Social Media Marketing*. (2017). Retrieved March 30, 2017, from <https://masterful-marketing.com/marketing-channel-strategy/>
- Statista. (2017). Retrieved March 30, 2017, from <https://www.statista.com/topics/2019/youtube/>
- Steimle, J. (2014). Traditional vs New Media Channels. Retrieved February 23, from <https://masterful-marketing.com/marketing-channel-strategy/>
- StyleHaul Network Statistics | StyleHaul. (n.d.). StyleHaul. Retrieved January 4, 2014, from <http://www.stylehaul.com/advertise/stats/>
- Tang, M. (2014). Effects of Vlogger Race on Perceived Credibility, Self-Efficacy and Behavioral Intentions Towards Weight Loss. *Social and Behavioral Sciences Common*.
- Thackeray, R., Neiger, B.L., Hanson, C.L., McKenzie, J.F., 2008. Enhancing promotional strategies within social marketing programs: use of Web 2.0 social media. *Health Promot.Pract.* 9 (4), 338–343.
- Till, B., & Busler, M. (1998). Matching Products with Attractiveness Versus Expertise. *Journal of Consumer Marketing* 15(6), 576-586.
- Unknown. (2014). Beauty on YouTube - Pixability Beauty Study Pixability. Retrieved May 13, 2014, from <http://www.pixability.com/industry-studies/beautystudy/>
- Vollmer, C., G. Precourt, (2008). *Always on: Advertising, marketing, and media in an era of consumer control*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- We Are Social*. (2017). Retrieved March 30, 2017, from <http://wearesocial.com/blog/2017/01/digital-in-2017-global-overview>